

# 7AAN2058 Philosophy of Medicine

Syllabus – Academic year 2019/20 (semester 1)

## Basic information

*Credits*

20

*Module Convenor/Lecturer*

Alexander Bird (Email: Alexander.Bird@kcl.ac.uk; Office: Philosophy Building 610)

*Lecture and seminar time and venue*

Fridays 09.00–11.00, PHILOSOPHY BLDG 405

<i>Module description</i>	<p>This module aims to give students an understanding of central topics in contemporary philosophy of medicine, with a particular emphasis on methodological issues in the clinical medical research. This module will cover topics that include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The nature of disease and illness</li><li>• What is mental illness?</li><li>• The Birth of the Clinic</li><li>• Revolutions in medicine</li><li>• Observational studies and Hill's criteria of causation</li><li>• Randomized controlled trials</li><li>• Evidence-Based Medicine</li></ul>
<i>Learning outcomes</i>	<p>By the end of the module, students will be able to demonstrate intellectual, transferable and practicable skills appropriate to a level-7 module. In particular they will be able to demonstrate:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• An understanding of certain central topics in contemporary philosophy of medicine</li><li>• An understanding of the significance of these questions for medicine and of their connection to related issues in wider philosophy</li><li>• An ability to use the techniques of philosophical argument to analyse and discuss questions arising from the study of these topics</li><li>• Transferable skills:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>○ analysing arguments</li><li>○ constructing a coherent and effective argument</li><li>○ writing a clear and well-structured essay around an argument</li></ul></li></ul>

## *Assessment*

Formative Assessment 1 x 3,000 max word essay

Send to Alexander Bird by 4pm on Wednesday 27 November

This will not count towards your mark for the module, but submitting the work by the due date is required in order to pass the module.

Informal assessment on presentations You will give a 10 minute presentation on the topic of your summative essay (see below) in one of the final two classes of the module. You will get feedback on your presentation. This will not count towards your mark for the module.

Summative Assessment 1 x 4,000 word essay

See KEATS or Timetable for date of assessment

(Note: Previously this was by exam. If you joined the MA expecting and strongly preferring an exam, please let me know.)

## *Consultation times*

Tuesday 11.00–12.00;

Wednesday 11.00–12.00.

I am very happy to arrange to meet at other times or to talk by Skype.

## *Books and Resources*

The readings for the course are separated into the following two categories:

Core Reading reading that everyone who wants proper coverage of the subject must read.

Further Reading additional readings to help further develop your views on a particular subject.

The best books on philosophy of medicine are:

Jeremy Howick (2011) *The Philosophy of Evidence-Based Medicine* (Oxford: Wiley–Blackwell)

Miriam Solomon (2015) *Making Medical Knowledge* (Oxford: Oxford University Press)

Alex Broadbent (2018) *Philosophy of Medicine* (Oxford: Oxford University Press)

Jacob Stegenga (2018) *Care and Cure* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press).

An interesting, if contentious, introduction to some topics in medical epistemology is:

Harry Collins and Trevor Pinch (2005) *Dr. Golem: How to Think about Medicine* (London: University of Chicago Press). A useful introduction to key themes in the epistemology of medicine. (ISBN: 0226113663)

Strongly recommended for historical background is:

David Wootton (2007) *Bad Medicine: Doctors Doing Harm Since Hippocrates* (Oxford: Oxford University Press)

## Other Resources

Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy <<https://plato.stanford.edu>>. Please ensure you respect the Encyclopedia's citation policy. See articles on:

- Philosophy of Psychiatry
- Mental Illness
- Concepts of Disease and Health
- Michel Foucault
- Philosophy of Medicine

## Topics and reading

### Week 1: Defining disease, health, and illness

#### Core Reading

Christopher Boorse, "Health as a Theoretical Concept" *Philosophy of Science* 44 (1977), pp.542-573 (especially, 542–59). <http://www.jstor.org/stable/186939>

Rachel Cooper, "Disease" *Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences*. 33 (2002), pp.263–82.

<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0039368102000183>

#### Further reading

A. Broadbent, *Philosophy of Medicine* Chapter 4.

J. Stegenga *Care and Cure* Chapter 2.

E. Kingma, "What is it to be healthy?" *Analysis* 67 (2007): 128–33.

<http://analysis.oxfordjournals.org/content/67/2/128.short#>

H. Carel, "Can I be Ill and Happy?" *Philosophia* 35 (2006): 95–110.

<http://www.springerlink.com/content/6246685672j455g1/>

### Week 2: The birth of the clinic and the changing face of disease

#### Core reading

Michel Foucault, *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception* (London, New York: Vintage 1973), Chps. 1, 8.

N.D. Jewson, "The disappearance of the sick-man from medical cosmology, 1770–1870"

*Sociology*, 10 (1976), pp.225-44. <http://soc.sagepub.com/content/10/2/225.full.pdf+html> also reprinted in *Int. J. Epidemiol.* (2009) 38 (3): 622-633.

<http://ije.oxfordjournals.org/content/38/3/622.full>

#### Further reading

Gary Gutting *Foucault A Very Short Introduction* Oxford (2005)

Charles Rosenberg, "Disease in History: Frames and Framers" *The Milbank Quarterly*, 67, Supplement 1 (1989), pp.1-15. W: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3350182>

Colin Jones and Roy Porter (eds) *Reassessing Foucault: Power, Medicine and the Body* (London 1994)

### Week 3: Scientific inference in medicine

#### Core Reading

Peter Lipton (2004) *Inference to the Best Explanation* (2<sup>nd</sup> edition) esp. chapter 4 "Inference to the Best Explanation"

Alexander Bird “Eliminative Abduction: Examples from Medicine” *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science* 41 (2010)

[http://eis.bris.ac.uk/~plajb/research/papers/Eliminative\\_Abduction.pdf](http://eis.bris.ac.uk/~plajb/research/papers/Eliminative_Abduction.pdf)

*Further reading*

Donald Gillies (2005) “Hempelian and Kuhnian Approaches in the Philosophy of Medicine: the Semmelweis Case” *Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences* 36, pp.159–81. <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1369848604000937>

#### **Week 4: Revolutions in science and medicine**

*Core reading*

Donald Gillies (2005) “Hempelian and Kuhnian Approaches in the Philosophy of Medicine: the Semmelweis Case” *Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences* 36, pp.159–81. <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1369848604000937>

T. S. Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (1962) esp. Chapter IX “The Nature and Necessity of Scientific Revolutions”

M. Worboys “Was there a Bacteriological Revolution in late nineteenth-century medicine?” *Studies in History and Philosophy of Science Part C: Studies in History and Philosophy of Biological and Biomedical Sciences* 38, 20-42, (2007)

<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1369848606000902>

*Further reading*

C. E. Rosenberg “The therapeutic revolution: medicine, meaning, and social change in nineteenth-century America” *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 20 (1977).

<https://muse.jhu.edu/article/404024/pdf>

A. Bird (2012). The Structure of Scientific Revolutions and its significance. *British Journal for the Philosophy of Science*, 63:859–83. <https://academic.oup.com/bjps/article/63/4/859/1561557>

#### **Week 5: The randomized controlled clinical trial**

*Core Reading*

Jeremy Howick (2011) *The Philosophy of Evidence-Based Medicine* (Oxford: Wiley–Blackwell) c.5

John Worrall (2007) “Evidence in Medicine and Evidence-Based Medicine” *Philosophy Compass* vol. 2 (6) pp. 981-1022 (see also his “What Evidence in Evidence-Based Medicine?” *Philosophy of Science*, 69 (2002), pp.S316-S330.)

*Further reading*

L. Gordis (2004) “Assessing the Efficacy of Preventive and Therapeutic Measures: Randomised Trials” in Merritt, J , Hall, A , eds. *Epidemiology*. Philadelphia: Elsevier. 115-129.

*Week 6: Reading week*

#### **Week 7: Epidemiology and inferring causation**

*Core reading*

Hill, A. B. (1965) “Environment and disease: Association or causation?” *Proceedings of the Royal Society of Medicine*, 58, 295–300

<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1898525/pdf/procrsmed00196-0010.pdf>

A. Bird (2011). The epistemological function of Hill’s criteria. *Preventive Medicine*, 53:242–5.

Kenneth Rothman and Sander Greenland (2005) "Causation and Causal Inference in Epidemiology" *American Journal of Public Health* 95 S144–50.  
<http://ajph.aphapublications.org/cgi/reprint/95/S1/S144>

*Further reading*

Mervyn Susser (1991) "What is a Cause and How do We Know One?" *American Journal of Epidemiology* 133 635–48. <http://aje.oxfordjournals.org/content/133/7/635.abstract>

**Week 8: The evidence-based medicine movement**

*Core reading*

Jeremy Howick (2011) *The Philosophy of Evidence-Based Medicine* (Oxford: Wiley–Blackwell) c.2.

John Worrall, "What Evidence in Evidence-Based Medicine?" *Philosophy of Science*, 69 (2002), pp.S316-S330

*Further reading*

A. Broadbent, *Philosophy of Medicine* Chapter 5.

J. Stegenga *Care and Cure* Chapter 7.

D. L. Sackett and Rosenberg 1995 "On the need for evidence-based medicine," *Journal of Public Health Medicine* 17, No. 3, pp. 330–34

<http://jpubhealth.oxfordjournals.org/cgi/reprint/17/3/330>

Evidence-based Medicine Working Group, "Evidence based medicine: A new approach to teaching the practice of medicine," *JAMA* 268 17(1992), 2420-25

**Week 9: Placebos and alternative medicine**

*Core reading*

Jeremy Howick (2011) *The Philosophy of Evidence-Based Medicine* (Oxford: Wiley–Blackwell) c.7

Harry Collins and Trevor Pinch, *Dr. Golem: How to Think about Medicine*, (London: University of Chicago Press, 2005, Chapters 4 and 8.

Ted J. Kaptchuk "Intentional Ignorance: A History of Blind Assessment and Placebo Controls in Medicine" *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 72 (1998) 389-433.

[http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/bulletin\\_of\\_the\\_history\\_of\\_medicine/v072/72.3kaptchuk.html](http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/bulletin_of_the_history_of_medicine/v072/72.3kaptchuk.html)

*Further reading*

A. Broadbent, *Philosophy of Medicine* Chapter 8.

Fabrizio Benedetti (2008) *Placebo Effects* Oxford

**Week 10: Student presentations week 1**

**Week 11: Student presentations week 2**